



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### Review of Tishani Doshi's Everything Begins Elsewhere

**Citation for published version:**

Gamble, M 2012, 'Review of Tishani Doshi's Everything Begins Elsewhere', *The Guardian* .  
<<http://www.theguardian.com/books/2012/jun/01/everything-begins-elsewhere-tishani-doshi-review>>

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

**Published In:**

The Guardian

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

© Gamble, M. (2012). Review of Tishani Doshi's Everything Begins Elsewhere. The Guardian

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



# Everything Begins Elsewhere by Tishani Doshi - review

The spirit of Indian dance infuses an assured and complex collection

**Miriam Gamble**  
The Guardian, Friday 1 June 2012 22:55 BST  
[Jump to comments \(0\)](#)



Chandralekha: a sensuous, taboo-breaking outlook. Photograph: Raghavendra Rao

Dance features prominently in [Tishani Doshi's](#) second collection, *Everything Begins Elsewhere*, which is dedicated to her one-time teacher and choreographer, [Chandralekha](#). Doshi worked with Chandralekha for a number of years, performing in [Sharira](#), her last ever production, and her work as a writer takes much from the sensuous, taboo-breaking outlook of her mentor. A feminist and human rights campaigner, Chandralekha revolutionised Indian dance, going against the grain of post-colonial "exotica" to celebrate (and often eroticise) the human body. She was a controversial figure, alternately loved and loathed, seen as a visionary by some and by others as "a woman not meriting respect". Poems such as "That Woman" and "Ode to the Walking Woman" reflect this fraught inheritance. However, it is in the quieter zone of discipline

[f Share](#) 0

[t Tweet](#) 0

[p Pin it](#) 1

[in Share](#) 0

[Email](#)



Article history

- [Books](#)
- [Poetry](#)
- [Culture](#)
- [More reviews](#)

- Related**
- 24 Dec 2013**  
[Writing in the Dark](#) by Richard Caddel: a quiet contemplation of night

**27 Apr 2013**  
[WARP, Book One: The Reluctant Assassin](#) by Eoin Colfer – review

**22 Jun 2012**  
[The Village](#) by Nikita Lalwani - review

**17 Feb 2012**  
[The Mara Crossing](#) by Ruth Padel – review



## Today's best video



**The week in TV**  
Andrew Collins reviews Rev (above); Martin Amis's England; A Very British Renaissance; Louis Theroux's LA Stories; and 35 Days  
[51 comments](#)



Netherlands

**Ashley Giles says sorry for England's defeat**  
England coach apologises for World Twenty20 defeat by

**Tom Cruise on Top Gun sequel**  
Hollywood star discusses possible follow-up to 1986 hit

that dance most makes its presence felt, and the relationship between poet and dancing pupil is complex.

Everything Begins Elsewhere

by Tishani Doshi



Buy the book

Tell us what you think: [Star-rate and review this book](#)

There are two parts to the book ("Everything Begins" and "Elsewhere"), so the poems display opposing attitudes to the spiritual demands of self-discipline, if not to the physical. *Everything Begins Elsewhere* is punctuated by "lesson" poems which chart Doshi's training as a dancer. In some of these, the spiritual and physical unite to achieve both beauty and transcendence:

... only after touching our heads  
to the diamond back of the earth,  
do we rise again, arched like curls  
of river silk, emptying our souls  
into the sky, forgetting the world.

In others, such as "Lesson 3: Stillness", the strength to overcome required of the dancer is jibbed against, viewed as bringing about not inner peace but "the bright suffocation of flowers" – the stiling of life itself.

One of the most striking features of Doshi's work is her imagery, and here, too, concrete and intangible are brought together in unusual conjunctions that sometimes stress affinity, sometimes impassable distance. In "Lesson 2: Learning Mudras in Bhutan", a woman "gives me the food she hasn't eaten all day, the words / she hasn't spoken" and the skills learnt render it possible to visualise a literal space "through which ... to escape" from an unhappy relationship. In "Buffaloes", on the other hand, outer and inner realities are at odds:

Think of all the invisible  
insurrections it takes  
to wake a city from slumber.  
In these woods, a single man  
will do, armed with a stick  
and a paltry collection of stones.

Doshi frequently employs Dante's trope of *selva oscura*, the dark wood, to represent the love relationship, so there is a metaphorical parallel to these paired ideas. However, she also knows how to pitch the artful against the blunt, the symbolically charged against the thing itself, to forceful effect. In "The River of Girls (i.m. India's missing girls)", a startling shift occurs between "This coin-thin vagina / and acid stain of bone" and "This doctor with his rusty tools": the poem, like many others, moves between the "myth" of art and the dirt of reality without giving the reader time to adjust to the gear change – the forced crunch of recognition is deeply unnerving.

The poems walk "that line between" in other areas: the collection's title is taken from [John Burnside](#), and Doshi, also a fan of [Don Paterson](#), pays tribute to Scottish influences through the play of light and dark, self and double. A repeat motif has evening bleed into night, and "That Woman", one of the best poems in the book, maps the uneasy and precarious relationship between polished surfaces and "dark undersides". Many poems are written in short, tentative lines, and some are centralised to create the visual effect of being marooned; others try to disentangle past, present and future, yet court situations in which such divisions are blurred. In "Sunday Afternoon", an ex-lover appears "when you're walking upstairs / for lunch; cutting broccoli into perfect spears": the



**How to become a professional gamer**  
Complexity Gaming members share tips after winning Call of Duty World Championships

Find books to review, discuss, buy

Search all (title, author or ISBN)  
Title only  
Author only

guardianbookshop

This week's bestsellers



1. **Do No Harm**  
by Henry Marsh  
£12.99

2. **Book of Forgiving**  
by Archbishop Desmond Tutu £11.99

3. **Guardian Quick Crosswords 5 & 6**  
£8.00

4. **Human Comedy**  
by Honore de Balzac £9.59

5. **This Boy**  
by Alan Johnson £6.39

Search the Guardian bookshop

Search

Writing courses from the Guardian




If you're a writer or an aspiring writer, the Guardian has a masterclass to help. Whether you're on your first novel or you're looking to write for stage or screen, we have the experts to help.  
[Browse our creative writing and publishing courses](#)



precision of this physical action sits in stark contrast to the emotional confusion of recognising that "Between this moment and the next / there's always space for a lover's return" – a space in which the self may, unwitting, "allow him to fall easily – into the future".

If the first section of *Everything Begins Elsewhere* seeks clarity, the second works in inverse, exploring situations in which severance from the past has actually happened, and finding "the world washed clean" to be "nothing but a trampling" rather than the promised "kiss of life". In truth, however, this is a book which disrespects comfortable systems, and the divisions between its parts are less than binding. In structure as in sense, Doshi works to trouble fixed categories even as she sometimes seeks their aid; the result is an invigorating, thought-provoking collection which, like the dancing Doshi loves, enlivens soul and senses, sharpening responses to both "the music of uncertainty" and "the aftertaste of rain".


• Miriam Gamble's *The Squirrels Are Dead* is published by Bloodaxe.





### Get the Guardian book club email


Hosted by John Mullan, be the first to find out about forthcoming events and featured authors.

[Sign up for the Guardian book club email](#)

 Share

 Tweet

 Share

 Email

More from the guardian



Piers Morgan fires parting shot at the NRA in final CNN show  
29 Mar 2014



Homes and gardens spring special: mess SOS – the home-office hoarder  
28 Mar 2014




Is Gwyneth's breakup note that much worse than a Facebook status update?  
27 Mar 2014




Harper Lee letters to be auctioned  
26 Mar 2014


More from around the web




Creative Inspiration in a Paris Bookstore (OIC Moments)



How to Make Your Portfolio Stand Out with a Few Short Words (Shutterstock)




Ron And Hermione Weren't Meant To Be. Neither Were These Guys (The Debrief)



What's Old is New Again No.10: Moleskine (late-19th Century/1997) (Mechanics of style)

On Books

Last 24 hours



1. Tips, links and suggestions: What are you reading this week?
2. Daniel Dennett's seven tools for thinking
3. April Fool's quiz: can you rumble these literary hoaxes?
4. Gone With the Wind prequel to tell Mammy's story
5. Paper vs digital reading is an exhausted debate


[More most viewed](#)

### THE NSA FILES



Follow NSA-related developments as controversy over leaks continues to make headlines

Latest reviews



The Poets' Wives review – a thought-provoking study of life and art  
David Park's evocative novellas examine the impact of art through the lives of three poets' wives, writes **Anita Sethi**

[More books reviews](#)

Letters Composed During a Lull in the Fighting review – 'aftermath of conflict'

A Splendid Little War by Derek Robinson review – Ukraine's 1919 battle

The Galápagos: A Natural History review

Frog Music review – Emma Donoghue's sophisticated whodunnit



Ads by Google

Buy Luxury Blankets

100% Natural Blankets & Throws! Beautiful Products at Great Prices.  
urbanara.co.uk/blankets-throws

Elderly Walk In Showers

Visit Us Now. Great Deals On Easy Access Showers. Get A Free Brochure  
www.premierbathrooms.co.uk/Showers

Print Your Own Book

Create professional-quality books Get your books in 7-10 days  
www.blurb.co.uk/book-making

All comments

Staff replies

Guardian picks

Comments for this discussion are now closed.

Related information

Books

Poetry ·

Culture



**Writing in the Dark** by Richard Caddel: a quiet contemplation of night

24 Dec 2013

18 Dec 2013: Written at night on a backlit handheld screen, **Billy Mills** says Caddel's final collection of poems is infused with a love of the world

27 Apr 2013

**WARP, Book One: The Reluctant Assassin** by Eoin Colfer – review

22 Jun 2012

**The Village** by Nikita Lalwani - review

17 Feb 2012

**The Mara Crossing** by Ruth Padel – review



**Beautiful Thing: Inside the Secret World of Bombay's Dance Bars** by Sonia Faleiro – review

29 Jul 2011

A riveting exposé lays bare the murky morality that dictates life for women in India, writes **Tishani Doshi**

Hot topics

Book news

Book reviews

Children's books

The Guardian Books Podcast

Edinburgh International Book Festival